From Verse Narrative to Novel: The Development of Prose Fiction in Vietnam

CAO THỊ NHỬ-QUỲNH JOHN C. SCHAFER

When Hoàng Ngọc Phách, a young Vietnamese living in Hanoi, published Tổ Tâm (Pure heart) in 1925, his book immediately became a cause célèbre. The first three thousand copies sold out in two weeks. The publisher printed another two thousand copies, and they too quickly disappeared from the bookstores (Phan Cự Đệ 1974:21). Girls disappointed in love succumbed to the influence of the work and committed suicide by jumping into Lake Tây or Lake Trúc Bạch. The work provoked a debate concerning what was proper reading for young women that continued into the 1930s.²

The book that created such a furor is a work of prose fiction about a twenty-year-old woman called Tổ Tâm,³ who falls in love with a student at the Teachers' College of the University of Hanoi. Nothing can cool her love, not even her learning that the student's parents have already arranged for him to marry someone else. After she obeys her mother and marries a man she does not love, she loses all desire to live and willingly

Both authors are affiliated with Humboldt State University in Arcata, California. Cao thi Như-Quỳnh is a reference librarian, and John C. Schafer, who became interested in Vietnamese literature while teaching at the University of Hue in central Vietnam in the late 1960s and early 1970s, is an associate professor of English.

The research for this article was assisted by a grant from the Joint Committee on Southeast Asia of the Social Science Research Council and the American Council of Learned Societies with funds provided by the Ford Foundation, the National Endowment for the Humanities, and the Henry Luce Foundation.

The authors interviewed Vietnamese scholars and writers now living in the United States and are indebted to them for many insights regarding the early development of the Vietnamese povel

¹To Tâm was written in 1922 when the author was still a student, and a portion of it appeared in a school publication. According to a preface written by Lê Huu Phúc, a friend of the author, publication in book form was delayed because the author feared the reaction of readers to a work "written in a new form to which we were not accustomed" (Hoàng Ngọc Phách [1925] 1963:v). Our references (henceforth TT) are to a reprint published in 1963.

²See, for example, *Phu Nũ Tân Văn* [Women's news]; Jan. 11 and Âug. 30, 1934.

³Tổ Tâm is a *hiệt-hiệu* (pen name, pseudonym) given the heroine by Đạm Thủy (also a pen name), the student she loves. These two main characters are almost always referred to throughout the novel by their pen names, a practice that emphasizes the literary and rarefied nature of their love (Công Huyền Tôn Nư Nha Trang 1982:8).

The Journal of Asian Studies 47, no. 4 (November 1988):756-777. © 1988 by the Association for Asian Studies, Inc.

surrenders to sickness and death. The author, a teacher and recent graduate himself of the teachers' college, was in many ways an unlikely person to have written such a controversial book, especially one that caused such tragic reactions in young women. A staunch believer in traditional Confucian morality, he had published an article a few years earlier in which he worried about the unhealthy effects that sentimental literature could have on young women (1920). To Tâm obviously conveyed a message not completely congruent with the conscious intent of its author.

Tổ Tâm was not the first Vietnamese novel—not the first long narrative written in vernacular Vietnamese prose. Much, of course, depends on how "novel" is defined. According to the definition we develop below, there were instances of the genre in the south, in what the French called Cochinchina, at least thirteen years before Tổ Tâm was published in northern Vietnam. But it was one of the first novels, and it affected contemporary readers more deeply and has received more attention from critics than other novels published around the same time. Tổ Tâm marks a rupture in Vietnam's literary and cultural life: it was perceived as something dramatically new. To appreciate its newness one has to understand what preceded it, including the traditional way of composing stories and the messages these stories were designed to convey. Before the novel emerged in Vietnam, the verse narrative was the preferred form for composing fictional stories. We will therefore compare Tổ Tâm to a nineteenth-century work entitled Luc Vân Tiên (ca. 1860), one of the last verse narratives to be written in chữ nôm, or southern script, a system of writing the Vietnamese language using Chinese characters.

As the American critic Lennard Davis (1983:2) points out, any discussion of the development of the novel must state clearly the criteria used to determine when narrative discourse turned into novelistic discourse. Common terms are not always reliable because people often apply the same term to very different kinds of works. The French, for example, use *roman* to refer to both romance and novel. We assume in this article that a novel is a fairly long story in prose. For other features of our definition we rely on Davis's discussion of ways that a romance differs from a novel. Davis is describing the beginnings of the English novel, but his nine points work well for our purposes because Vietnamese verse narratives like *Luc Vân Tiên* are also romances—different, of course, from Western romances but sharing certain key features with them.

In speaking of the origins of the English novel, Davis argues against the idea that the romance is "a forbear of, a relative of, or an influence on the novel." Instead, he argues, there was "a profound rupture, a discursive chasm between these two forms" (1983:25). That is the point of his nine distinctions: to emphasize the rupture. In Vietnam the rupture was in some respects more profound than it was in England because the movement from one genre to the other was also a movement from verse to prose, from logographic writing to an alphabetical system, from circulation by

⁴This is not the accepted view of most Vietnamese and Western literary historians. Most argue that *Tổ Tâm* and another work published the same year (1925), *Quả Dua Đỏ* (The red melon) by Nguyễn Trọng Thuật, also a northerner, were the first novels to appear in Vietnam. We present our arguments for the novel's southern origins in another article (Cao thị Như-Quỳnh and Schafer:forthcoming).

⁵Quả Đưa Đỏ (see n. 4) received high praise and was avidly read but it was not as controversial a work as Tổ Tâm. It is only a quasi-novel and is more accurately described as a romance or as a piece of didactic prose fiction along the lines of Gulliver's Travels. Nhất Linh's Nho Phong (Confucian manners), which also appeared in 1925, received less attention than either Tổ Tâm or Quả Dửa Đỏ primarily because, aside from the fact that it was written in prose, it closely resembled the traditional verse narratives. Nhất Linh was also a younger, unproven writer in 1925.

woodblock printing and oral performance to circulation by movable type printing and private reading, from the literacy of scholars toward a literacy that was much more widespread.

Before beginning our comparison we will consider some of the terms used by Vietnamese to refer to different kinds of narratives. We must also explain the movement from a logographic writing system ($ch\vec{u}$ $n\hat{o}m$) to an alphabetical system ($qu\hat{o}c$ $ng\vec{u}$) because this change made possible the development of the Vietnamese novel.

Tiểu Thuyết, Truyền Kỳ

Like the Chinese term *hsiao-shuo* (literally, small story) from which it is derived, the Vietnamese term tiểu thuyết may be applied to various kinds of narratives. Most Vietnamese literary historians use the term to refer to a modern novel following the Western model, as an equivalent to roman or "novel." Some literary historians like Thanh Lang use it more generally to refer to a structured narrative whether in verse or prose: Thanh Lang classifies Vietnamese verse narratives (for example, Truyên Kiều (The story of Kiều) and Lục Vân Tiên) as tiểu thuyết (1967, 2:441-49). Usually, however, if the term refers to a narrative in verse it appears with a qualifying phrase. Pham Quỳnh calls Truyện Kiều a tiểu thuyết "written in verse" (viết bằng vận văn; 1921:4). Phan Cự Đệ sometimes refers to traditional Vietnamese verse narratives as "classical novels' (tiểu thuyết cổ điển) to distinguish them from modern prose novels, which he calls simply tiểu thuyết (1975:39, 52). Vietnamese literary historians like Phan Cư Đê also use tiểu thuyết at times to refer to both nineteenth-century verse narratives and twentieth-century prose narratives when they want to emphasize similarities between these two kinds of discourse—to present the modern Vietnamese novel as the result of indigenous development as well as Western influence.

Vietnamese use the term truyền kỳ, derived from the Chinese ch'uan-ch'i (literally, to narrate strange things), to refer to "the retelling of stories, handed down from the past, about strange events" (Phạm Thế Ngũ 1965, 1:143). More specifically, by truyền kỳ Vietnamese mean stories told in prose such as those in Việt Điện U Linh Tập (Spiritual powers in the Viet realm), a collection of tales written in Chinese, and compiled by Lý Tế Xuyên in 1329. This collection contains twenty-seven tales arranged under three headings: tales of sovereigns, tales of ministers, and tales of superhuman powers. The tales record the achievements of Vietnamese heroes who distinguished themselves by fighting foreign—usually Chinese—invaders. The spirits who figure in the stories, such as the mountain spirit from Thanh-hóa and the fire dragon spirit, represent supernatural powers that Vietnamese believed played an important role in human history. There is also a fifteenth-century compilation of truyền kỳ stories called Lĩnh Nam Trích Quái (Selected tales of extraordinary beings in Lĩnh Nam) and a sixteenth-century collection called Truyền Kỳ Mạn Lục (Giant anthology of strange tales).

Many truyền kỳ stories are based on earlier written records, and twenty of the twenty-seven stories in Việt Điện U Linh Tập contain an acknowledgment of an earlier

⁶Or more precisely in Sino-Vietnamese, a term preferred by some scholars because the language of this early literature was not completely Chinese. When read aloud, it would be given a Vietnamese pronunciation and, according to Nguyễn Ngọc Bích (pers. com. 1986), sometimes its syntax varied slightly from classical Chinese. We have written the titles of these truyền kỳ stories in the modern Vietnamese orthography, which indicates how Vietnamese pronounce them. The original stories were written in Chinese characters. See DeFrancis 1977:14–16 for a discussion of the term Sino-Vietnamese.

source. The story of Muc Thân, for example, one of the "minister" tales in Việt Điện U Linh Tập, begins "Examining the Historical Records," a reference to a work compiled in the early twelfth century by a palace attendant in the court of King Lý Dương Hoán (Taylor 1986:32–33). Other stories in this and other collections of truyền kỳ appear to be the first inscriptions of stories that were previously transmitted by word of mouth within an oral culture. Although written in Chinese, all the stories in these collections are Vietnamese stories. They are the first recorded examples of Vietnamese prose narrative. Phan Cự Đệ points out that as one moves from older to more recent truyền kỳ collections, one encounters tales that are longer, more fictionalized, more often about ordinary people (less focused on supernatural happenings), and more often about events that relate to the period of the compiler (1975, 2:38–42). In summary, Vietnamese were writing stories in prose long before the twentieth century, and these stories can be seen as moving from folk history and mythology toward discourse that was more novelistic. But these stories were written in Chinese, not Vietnamese.

Truyện Thơ Nôm and Chữ Nôm

Most Vietnamese call their verse narratives truyện thơ nôm or truyện nôm, not tiểu thuyết. Truyện means simply story; thơ means poem or poetry; and nôm refers to a way of writing the Vietnamese language using Chinese characters. These characters were called chữ nôm, a phrase that in English is sometimes rendered as "southern characters" (because nôm is generally considered as deriving from nam—south) or "demotic characters" or "demotic script" (because these characters were used to write the Vietnamese language—the language of the common people; (DeFrancis 1977:27). Scholars debate when this script was first used. In 1970 Đào Duy Anh, a scholar in the Democratic Republic of Vietnam, located a stele dated 1210 from a temple in what is now Vĩnh-Phúc Province. On this stele the names of villages that made donations for the building of the temple are inscribed in chữ nôm. Thus this script was certainly in use in the early thirteenth century, and some scholars believe it was used at least in a limited way as early as the eighth century (Nguyễn Đình Hòa 1982:30).

Chủ nôm was a complex system that employed Chinese characters as both phonetic and semantic indictors. The Vietnamese word một (one), for example, was represented in chủ nôm by a Chinese character with the meaning "to drown" or "to lose." This character was chosen because the Chinese word "drown/lose" sounded like the Vietnamese word một. In this case the nôm character was a pure phonetic indicator. Other Vietnamese words were rendered in chủ nôm by using Chinese characters as semantic indicators. There were also composite creations formed by using one Chinese character as a phonetic indicator, another as a semantic indicator. Chủ nôm was not a consistent system: characters were written differently depending on an individual writer's style, the region he was from, and the period in which he lived (Dương Quảng Hàm [1941] 1968:113–17; DeFrancis 1977:24–26). Despite its inadequacies, chủ nôm became an important invention for Vietnamese. It allowed them to express themselves in their native language and to give vent to personal feelings that would be more difficult to convey in a second language. It also enabled the Vietnamese scholar-gentry to com-

⁷Some Vietnamese scholars have argued that *truyền kỳ* stories and other literature written by Vietnamese in Chinese (or Sino-Vietnamese; see note 6) should not be considered a part of the national literature of Vietnam, but most scholars disagree. Durand 1962 summarizes this debate, which was conducted in a series of articles appearing in the journal *Văn Sủ Địa* (Literature, history, geography) in the 1950s.

municate with ordinary Vietnamese. Nonliterate peasants could not read a nôm text, but if they heard one read, they could understand it; and if it was written in a poetic form with parallelism, rhythm, rhyme, and other mnemonic devices, they could memorize it and recite it for others to enjoy. Because chuł nôm enabled disaffected court officials and members of the gentry to reach the common people, some Vietnamese rulers tried to suppress it (DeFrancis 1977:37–38). They failed, however, and literature in nôm continued, reaching its crowning achievement in the truyện thơ nôm, or verse narrative.

Exactly when the first truyện thơ nôm was written is not clear, but perhaps as early as the thirteenth century Vietnamese poets began to use a traditional verse form called luc bát (literally, six-eight) to tell a story. The luc bát form requires couplets with first a six-word, then an eight-word line—hence the name. There are also requirements related to the placement of rhyming words and words with certain tones. For several reasons, the form was perfect for telling quite long stories in verse. It was familiar to both literate and nonliterate Vietnamese primarily because it was often employed in a popular kind of folk poetry called ca dao. Ca dao verses are usually only one or two couplets long; they are short lyrics often expressing the romantic yearnings of peasants closely attached to the rice fields that provided them with their means of livelihood. At some point Vietnamese poets perceived that some of the features of the luc bát form made it an excellent medium for telling longer stories. In luc bát each line rhymes with the preceding line, but new rhymes constantly appear, yielding a scheme that avoids monotony when prolonged to tell a story (Huỳnh Sanh Thông 1979:xxxiii). In the hands of a master like Nguyễn Du, whose Truyên Kiều (Tale of Kiều) is the most highly praised verse narrative, the *luc bát* form becomes an effective vehicle of poetic expression. Nguyễn Đình Chiếu's Luc Vân Tiên, composed when some Vietnamese were already "putting down their brushes" (used to write nôm characters) and "taking up their pens" (used to write the new roman script), has received less praise, but it is still one of the better examples of the genre. It has been especially popular in the south.

Quốc Ngữ

The French Jesuit missionary Alexandre de Rhodes is generally credited with devising a system of writing Vietnamese using roman characters. He presented his system in 1651 when he published a Vietnamese-Portuguese-Latin dictionary and a catechism. The transcription system employed in these two works eventually became, after only minor changes, the system presently used to write the Vietnamese language. It generally follows the principle that each phoneme should be represented by a separate grapheme. Roman letters are used for consonant and vowel sounds with additional diacritical marks to indicate vowel quality and tones.

This system was presented in 1651, but it did not begin to be widely used until after 1905. After de Rhodes's dictionary and catechism, 187 years passed before another book was published in the roman script, a Vietnamese-Latin-Latin-Vietnamese dictionary written by Father Jean-Louis Taberd, another French missionary (DeFrancis 1977:64). Vietnamese continued to write in Chinese or in *chū nôm* throughout the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Both Phan Chu Trinh and Phan Bội Châu, two influential anticolonial leaders during the 1920s, wrote their revolutionary tracts in Chinese, revealing the Vietnamese tendency to write in Chinese when they wrote prose. *Chū nôm* was used almost exclusively for poetry.

⁸De Rhodes was greatly assisted by other missionaries. See DeFrancis 1977:54-60.

Why did so many years pass before the new script, which in the late 1860s came to be called quốc ngữ (national language), was used more widely? This question is important because the emergence of the novel in Vietnam is related to the development of the roman script and to the increased literacy that this new script, which is very easy to learn, made possible. Its answer helps explain why the novel did not emerge in Vietnam until early in this century. One reason for the slow growth of quốc ngữ is that Alexandre de Rhodes and his fellow missionaries apparently devised it only for their own use—as an aid in learning Vietnamese and in preparing sermons for delivery in Vietnamese. They probably taught it to Vietnamese priests, but there is no evidence they attempted to spread its use more widely into the Vietnamese community. A second reason for the slow growth of quốc ngữ is the inconsistent language policy of the French colonial administration. Paul Bert, resident general in Annam and Tonkin, favored limited support for quốc ngữ, arguing that students would learn French more quickly if they first learned to read and write texts in their own language written in roman letters. Étienne Aymonier, director of the École Coloniale, on the other hand, opposed quốc ngữ and argued for direct instruction in French. Because of this vacillation quốc ngu was taught much more intensely in some parts of Vietnam than in others (DeFrancis 1977:48-66, 136-40).

Another reason Vietnamese did not adopt quốc ngữ more quickly is that many perceived it and French as the languages of collaboration and Chinese and chữ nôm as the languages of resistance. DeFrancis (1977:159–69) argues convincingly that quốc ngữ finally began to take hold in Vietnam only after Phan Bội Châu and Phan Chu Trinh and the leaders of the Đông Kinh Nghĩa Thục (Tonkin Free School)⁹ began to promote it as a tool of nationalism.

Lục Vân Tiên: One of the Last Truyện Thơ Nôm

Nguyễn Đình Chiếu (1822–88), the composer of *Luc Vân Tiên*, was born in Gia Đinh Province, the son of a mandarin from central Vietnam. He passed the first rung of the civil service examinations in 1843 and was studying for the metropolitan examinations (*hội thí*), the next level, when he received word that his mother had died. Quickly abandoning his hopes for passing the exams, he began an arduous journey home to mourn his mother's death. Soon after, he became sick and eventually blind. Settling in his home in Gia Định Province, he began to support himself as a doctor of traditional medicine and as a teacher. His compatriots came to love and respect him not only for his popular poems but also for his support of local resistance leaders and, when the battle was lost, his refusal to cooperate with the French authorities (Võ Lang 1964:1510–17).

He composed Luc Vân Tiên around 1860 in traditional luc bất verse form, dictating it to others who wrote it in chữ nôm. Nineteenth-century writers like Nguyễn Đình Chiếu preferred to tell their stories in verse: because only 3 to 5 percent of the population knew chữ nôm, 10 writers who wanted an audience of significant size had to compose their stories in a form that possessed the mnemonic devices to make oral dissemination possible. This is the first and perhaps the most obvious difference between Luc Vân Tiên and Tổ Tâm: the former was written in verse in a logographic writing system and

⁹The French allowed this school to be established in March 1907 but closed it in January 1908 because it was spreading a spirit of nationalism. See Marr 1971:156–84.

¹⁰DeFrancis (1977:19) cites He Le-geng's estimate that only 3 to 5 percent of the population ever mastered Chinese characters, which one would have to know to write *chū nôm*.

circulated in what was essentially an oral culture; the latter was written in prose in an alphabetical script and circulated in a society in which literacy was not yet extensive but was spreading rapidly.

Other differences appear in elements of the two stories themselves. There are autobiographical elements in both: Nguyễn Đình Chiếu and his character Vân Tiên are blinded under almost identical circumstances; Hoàng Ngọc Phách and Đạm Thủy are both students at the Teachers' College of the University of Hanoi.

Summary of Luc Vân Tiên

As the story begins, Luc Vân Tiên says good-bye to his teacher and sets off for the capital to take the examinations. On the way he saves the beautiful Kiều Nguyệt Nga whom brigands have kidnapped. Her gratitude quickly turns to love. She writes him a poem to express her appreciation and returns to her home where she pines for her gallant rescuer. Vân Tiên never gets to the examination site because he hears that his mother has died, and he returns immediately to participate in her funeral. On his journey he becomes so sick and weak from weeping for his mother that he eventually goes blind and becomes an easy victim for a host of evil characters, including the parents of a woman that his parents had planned for him to marry. Afraid they will be stuck with a worthless blind man for a son-in-law, his prospective in-laws leave him to die in a cave. A fairy leads him out and, assisted by a friendly woodcutter, he ends up in a pagoda where the narrator allows him to rest while recounting the misfortunes of his heroine.

Hearing mistakenly that Vân Tiên has died, Nguyệt Nga vows to remain chaste and forever loyal to his memory. A spurned suitor persuades the king to offer her as a tribute wife to the King of Phiên, a country that has been harassing the country of Sơ (the home of the hero and heroine). Forced to make an impossible choice between faithfulness to Vân Tiên and loyalty to the king, Nguyệt Nga attempts suicide by jumping off the boat taking her to the land of Phiên. She is saved by the Buddhist goddess of mercy and eventually takes refuge in the home of a kind old woman.

The narrator then returns to Vân Tiên, whose luck begins to change. His sight is restored by a fairy who visits him in a dream, and he reviews his lessons and passes the examinations with the highest rank. At the king's request he leads a successful expedition against the Ô-Qua, enemies of the land of So. At the end of this battle he stumbles on the old lady's home where Nguyệt Nga has taken refuge. They are joyfully reunited and later happily married. The King of So, eager to retire to a pagoda, allows Vân Tiên to take over the throne. While the virtuous are being rewarded, the evil are getting their just deserts: the prospective father-in-law who left Vân Tiên to die in a cave dies of shame, his wife and daughter get eaten by two tigers, and an unfaithful friend of Vân Tiên's is devoured by a whale when his boat capsizes.

Summary of To Tâm

Tổ Tâm is presented as a story told to the author by a friend, Đạm Thủy, who has just graduated from the Teachers' College in Hanoi. The story concerns Đạm Thủy's love for Tổ Tâm, a daughter of a wealthy widow (Bà Án) whose mandarin husband has died. Đạm Thủy meets Tổ Tâm by chance when her uncle recovers a wallet Đạm Thủy lost and Tổ Tâm's mother summons him to their house to return it. As he leaves the house after the visit, he catches a glimpse of the beautiful Tổ Tâm and also notices

on a table a dog-eared, obviously carefully read copy of a novel he has written. Invited by Tổ Tâm's mother and encouraged by her young brother, Đạm Thủy returns regularly to visit and becomes a friend of the family. At first he treats Tổ Tâm like a sister, but soon they fall hopelessly in love. Tổ Tâm has studied Chinese as a child and later French. She loves to talk about literature, to write poems and essays, and they pass many pleasant hours reciting poetry and discussing social issues. When Bà Án and her daughter go to the seaside near Hải Phòng, Đạm Thủy visits them and he and Tổ Tâm take romantic walks on the beach at Đồ-sơn.

Their love is hopeless, however, because Đạm Thủy's family has already arranged for him to marry another woman, the daughter of old family friends, and Đạm Thủy respects his family too much to oppose his parents' wishes. When he tells Tổ Tâm about his parents' plans for his marriage, Tổ Tâm says she has known about them for a long time and that she is reconciled to a "love without hope." They continue to see each other, but things come to a crisis when Bà Án expresses her wish that Tổ Tâm marry a promising graduate who has a French baccalauréat degree. At first she refuses, but when her mother becomes ill and insists, she finally agrees to marriage but never lets her husband consummate their union. After the marriage she becomes very ill and dies. The medical cause of death is consumption—pulmonary tuberculosis—but it is clear, as she says in the epitaph she wrote for herself, that she died for love. When Đạm Thủy calls on her mother and brother after her death, her brother, carrying out a request of his sister, gives Đạm Thủy a diary that she has kept faithfully throughout her illness.

Up to this point the tale has been presented as told to the ký gia (reporter, recorder) by Đạm Thủy. When Đạm Thủy mentions the diary he gives it to the writer and lets him read it. Most of chapter 4 consists of diary entries. In Tổ Tâm's last entry, written just before she died, she tells Đạm Thủy to engrave these words on a tree or stone near her grave: "Here is the grave of an unfortunate person who died for love." In chapter 5, the last chapter, Đạm Thủy explains how he became ill after Tổ Tâm died but was nursed back to physical and spiritual health by his brother, a successful landowner. His brother's treatment involves a ban on the reading of sad poems and romantic novels coupled with discussions about family responsibility and his future career. The story ends with Đạm Thủy explaining to the writer that he will follow the advice of his brother and the woman who died for him (for Tổ Tâm also had reminded him of his responsibilities to his family and country) but that the wounds from his love for Tổ Tâm will always be with him.

From Romance to Novel

We will now apply Davis's nine differences between romance and novel to these two Vietnamese narratives and assess how well they account for the movement from verse narrative to novel. We will begin with setting, the topic of Davis's first and third distinctions:

- 1. The romance is set in the distant, idealized past; the novel is set in a more recent, less heroic setting.
- 3. The romance is usually not set in the country of the author but in a remote exotic location; the novel tends to be set in the locale of the author. (Davis 1983:40)

The contrast between settings is clear. Luc Vân Tiên is set roughly during the time of the Chou and Ch'in dynasties (1027–206 B.C.), but Nguyễn Đình Chiều makes no attempt to keep his historical references consistent. Characters refer to historical per-

sonages who lived during later dynasties, for example. The geographical references are also neither consistent nor accurate. The setting is an idealized Sino-Vietnamese land-scape; Nguyễn Đình Chiều makes no attempt to portray a real locale. Vân Tiên goes to Trường An (Ch'ang-an, modern Sian), the T'ang capital of China, to take his examinations, but scholars have not been able to find real-world referents for many of the other place names. (Trần Nghĩa 1969:126–28). Tố Tâm, on the other hand, takes place at the time and in the locale of the author. Đạm Thủy, the hero, has just graduated from the modern teachers' college established by the French. Tố Tâm, the heroine, lives in "district X" in "house #58" in Hanoi.

Davis's second distinction relates to models:

2. The romance is based on the epic; the novel is modeled on history and journalism. (1983:40)

This distinction is somewhat more problematic, but only because Vietnam does not have a genre exactly corresponding to the Western epic. Vietnamese verse narratives have some features associated with the epic, however: like Western epics they are long narrative poems that tell of historical or legendary deeds; like the Homeric epics they contain many formulaic expressions, including proverbs and four-word idiomatic expressions, that facilitate dissemination in an oral society; and they may, like a Western epic, tell a story that is central in the society. Many have argued, for example, that Nguyễn Du's Truyện Kiều expresses the national soul of the Vietnamese; 11 although we are not aware of such claims for Luc Vân Tiên, this poem glorifies those persons who protect their virtue and defend their country from foreign invaders—certainly central themes in Vietnamese history.

Tổ Tâm, in contrast, is modeled on journalism. Hoàng Ngọc Phách says in his preface (pp. ix-xii) that he is going to tell a story he heard from a friend. He assumes the stance of a reporter and refers to himself in the first person, often using ký gia (recorder, reporter) in lieu of the first person pronoun tôi. One encounters sentences like the following: "This reporter had some personal business and had to stay at school; crossing over to the room of the new graduates, seeing this reporter's close friend Lê Thanh Vân, whose pen name was Đạm Thủy, packing his things before returning to his village, this reporter sat down and watched him pack" (p. 14). Hoàng Ngọc Phách, unlike Nguyễn Đình Chiều, is writing recent history—news.

Davis states his fourth distinction as follows:

4. The romance depicts the life of the aristocracy and is designed for an upper-class reader; the novel tends to be more middle class in scope and is geared to a slightly less aristocratic readership. (1983:40)

This distinction illuminates a difference between Luc Vân Tiên and Tố Tâm, but it needs some qualification. Luc Vân Tiên does depict aristocratic figures: Vân Tiên and Nguyệt Nga are from the upper class and Vân Tiên takes over the throne at the end of the narrative. There are, however, some minor characters from the peasant class—the woodcutter who assists Vân Tiên and the old woman who helps Nguyệt Nga, for example. Because Luc Vân Tiên existed as both a written text read by members of

¹¹See, for example, Pham Quỳnh (1919). Because more revolutionary-minded Vietnamese considered Pham Quỳnh to be a lackey of the French and suspected he was using the poem to preach submission to colonialism, his views became extremely controversial. See Marr (1981:154–55). A Western scholar, Eric Henry, concludes that "the safest course would be to characterize [Truyện Kiều] as a romance in verse with affinities to epic" but that the less cautious could call it an epic and not be wrong (1984:81).

¹²Trần Văn Giàu (1969) stresses the importance of these humble characters in *Lục Vân Tiên*

the scholar-gentry and an oral text memorized and recited by illiterate common people, we can not say it was designed only for aristocratic readers. We can, however, say that it was not geared for the middle class. To Tâm, on the other hand, is clearly "middle class in scope." Hoàng Ngọc Phách, himself a member of the new petite bourgeoisie that emerged in Vietnam between the world wars, peoples his work with middle-class characters like himself and clearly writes for a middle-class audience. To Tâm was first published, after all, in a university newspaper whose student readers aspired to be teachers and educational administrators.

Length is the focus of the next distinction:

5. Romances tend to be long and episodic; novels are shorter and more compact of plot. (Davis 1983:40)

Luc Vân Tiên is not long by the standards of a European prose romance, but it runs to 2,150 lines, long for a verse narrative. It is definitely episodic, as the plot summary reveals, and exhibits nicely the traditional Sino-Vietnamese linear, string-of-beads method that Pham Quỳnh (1921:8) refers to as "straight road" (đường thẳng) narration: events are narrated one after the other with no digressions, flashbacks, or long intervening passages of description. Like most truyện thơ nôm, Lục Vân Tiên has a tripartite structure consisting of a chance encounter between hero and heroine, a period of separation and suffering, and a joyful reunion. Nguyễn Đình Chiều alternates between accounts of Vân Tiên's and Nguyệt Nga's adventures, announcing his transitions from one to the other in rather heavy-handed fashion. After Vân Tiên and Nguyệt Nga meet, he begins his first section (thứ), which is about Vân Tiên, as follows: "There is still much to tell about her [Nguyệt Nga's] story, / But please let me record the first section of Vân Tiên's story" (lines 285-86). Usually he finds a peaceful place a pagoda (for Vân Tiên), the home of a kind old woman (for Nguyêt Nga)—where one character rests while he recounts the adventures of the other. There are six thú (sections), all explicitly marked by these narrator intrusions. They probably reflect the demands of oral recitation. The poem was often chanted by singers, and both they and their listeners may have needed a rest after three hundred lines. Nguyễn Văn Dần (1967:56), who comes from the southern region of Vietnam, where Luc Vân Tiên was especially popular, says he remembers that singers used to memorize Luc Vân Tiên by thú; those who had memorized all six would take requests from the audience and chant any thú their listeners desired to hear.

Tổ Tâm, which is short (103 pages), is organized quite differently. Hoàng Ngọc Phách calls his novel a tiểu thuyết tâm lý (psychological novel), and we have more to say below about what he understands by this term. Here we want to point out only that it is an apt term for the way Tổ Tâm is structured. There are very few episodes in Tổ Tâm—no clashes with brigands or foreign invaders, no last-minute rescues; the action is psychological, not physical. There are quite long passages describing natural scenes and the feelings of the lovers. But the most modern feature is the ending. Instead of the traditional $h\hat{a}\mu$ (ending) in which the hero passes his examinations first in his class and marries the heroine, the novel ends sadly with the death of the heroine. Since Tổ Tâm's only fault is to love someone too intensely, her death seems unjust.

and argues that because of their presence the poem expresses a Vietnamese "nhân-nghĩa" (love and righteousness) different from that presented in the Confucian texts—different because it seems to emanate from the land and the people and is not exhibited only by a scholarly elite. Trần Văn Giàu and other Hanoi critics admire Nguyễn Đình Chiều because he refused to cooperate with the French but they are disturbed by his Confucianism, with its stress on loyalty to the king.

By ending in this way Hoàng Ngọc Phách's novel suggests a more complex moral world than the one created by Nguyễn Đình Chiều in *Lục Vân Tiên*.

Davis also discusses pronoun usage and the perspectives and forms through which a narrative may be told:

7. Novels of the eighteenth century tend to be written in the first person or in letter form; romances are never written in these forms. (1983:40)

Traditional verse narratives like Lic Van Tien are never told in the first person. The modern first person pronoun $t \hat{o}i$ (I) originally meant "subject"; sometimes, for example, the phrase vua- $t \hat{o}i$ (king-subject) is used to refer to the first Confucian bond. Phan Khôi (1930:13) explains that some writers avoid this pronoun because they think it is too self-deprecatory—the way a slave would refer to himself. In conversations with friends and whenever they want to avoid being cold and impersonal, Vietnamese use kinship terms as pronouns to refer to themselves and others. A boy, for example, may use the word $ch\acute{a}u$ (literally, nephew) as a first person pronoun and $b\acute{a}c$ (literally, father's older brother) as a second person pronoun in a conversation with an older man in the village. $T \acute{o}i$, which has no kinship meaning and conveys no sense of intimacy, began to be used more as Vietnam modernized and people in larger towns needed a way of referring to themselves when they talked with strangers.

This sociolinguistic situation partially explains why composers of verse narratives would not write in the first person: they would not know what pronoun to use. There are, however, other explanations, ones related to the traditional concept of authorship—and to Davis's eighth and ninth distinctions:

- 8. Romances make clear that they are mixing fact and fiction to create an essentially fictional plot; novels tend to deny that they are fictional.
- 9. Romances follow the rules of *bienseance* and *vraisemblance*; novelists openly reject these rules since they claim to be writing history or recording life as it is. (1983:40)

The composers of traditional (Latin traditio, handing over) verse narratives do not tell stories of individuals living in their own time; they pass on stories found in old books. They take their plots from Chinese romances, 13 usually from "talent-meets-beauty stories" (tr'ai-tzu chia-jen; Sino-Vietnamese; tài-tu giai-nhân), a type of story that began to be written in late Ming times and flourished during the Ch'ing dynasty. C. T. Hsia describes the plot of these stories as follows: "The sentimental novels about a scholar and a beauty or beauties . . . usually have a very simple plot. Some villain or villains will cross their path, but the lovers are finally happily married, usually after the scholar has earned top honors at the examinations and the beauty has vindicated her honor" (1968:329). The Vietnamese verse narrative Nhi Độ Mai (Twice-blooming plum flower; late eighteenth century) is based on a Chinese novel with the same title (Erh Tu Mei; sixteenth or seventeenth century; author unknown). Nguyễn Du took the plot for Truyện Kiều from the Chinese novel Chin Yün Ch'iao chuan, published in the second half of the seventeenth century (ca. 1660–90). Nguyễn Đình Chiều took elements for the plot of Luc Vân Tiên from Nhị Độ Mai (Schafer 1983).

Some narrators, like the one in Nhi $D\hat{o}$ Mai, mention the title of the older book; others make a vaguer reference to their source. Here, for example, are the seventh and

¹³Applying Davis's criteria, we call these works romances, but Henry (1984:63) makes the interesting observation that the Ming and Ch'ing talent-meets-beauty stories are closer to early European novels than Chinese "classic novels" like *The Scholars* and *Dream of the Red Chamber*—closer in the sense that they focus on "the struggles of protagonists rather than upon the growth and decay of social groups."

eighth lines of Nguyễn Du's Truyện Kiều: "By lamplight turn these scented leaves and read / a tale of love recorded in old books." Here the "leaves" (su xanh) is a reference to the old custom of recording historical events on bamboo leaves (Huỳnh Sanh Thông 1983:3, 169). Luc Vân Tiên begins, "Before the light look at the story of Tây-Minh" (no story of Tây Minh has been found). 14 These vaguer references to obscure sources suggest that by the nineteenth century referring to an older book as a source for one's story was becoming a convention. Stories no longer contain straightforward bibliographical references like the phrase "Examining the Historical Records" used by Lê Tế Xuyên, the fourteenth-century compiler of Vietnamese truyên kỳ stories mentioned above. But neither do they employ the kinds of devices used by novelists to achieve "formal realism," such as the manuscript trouvé. 15 Composers of verse narratives have moved away from historical discourse to the quasi-historical discourse characteristic of romance, but they have not completely severed their ties with historical writing and become confident inventors of fictions.

Poets included these vague references not to avoid charges of plagiarism (originality is not something traditional authors believe they must achieve) but to suggest that the stories they were telling had a basis in historical fact and were not completely invented. Most stories were indeed based on fact. The Chinese stories to which many Vietnamese verse narratives refer are about actual historical events. Lu-ky, for example, an evil character in both the Chinese and Vietnamese versions of Nhi Đô Mai, was an actual person who caused the T'ang emperors a great deal of trouble. 16 The Chinese novel from which Nguyễn Du took the plot of Truyện Kiều is based loosely on historical events that occurred in sixteenth-century China (Henry 1984). The authors of Vietnamese verse narratives refer to earlier sources not to assume completely the stance of a historian but to make their tales more credible by linking them to actual people and events. In other words, they follow the rule of vraisemblance, or resemblance, which refers to the practice of tying one's story to historical fact. Vraisemblance contrasts with the realism of the novel. Unlike novelists, romance writers do not try to report life accurately: after tying their protagonists to history, they allow them to win hearts and slay enemies (and pass examinations) in very unrealistic ways. The allegiance of Vietnamese romance writers to the rule of vraisemblance and their avoidance of the first person are related. If one adopts the stance of a reteller of a story that is based on historical fact and comes from old books, then it is appropriate to avoid the first person: it is not your story that you are telling; it belongs to the tradition. 17

The stance assumed by the narrator of To Tâm differs sharply from the stance of the composers of verse narratives. Hoàng Ngọc Phách tells his story in the first person,

¹⁴There is, however, a Chinese moral essay by Trương Tái (Chinese, Chang Tsai) entitled

Tây Minh. See Trần Nghĩa 1969.

15 Watt (1957:32) uses the term "formal realism"; Booth (1966:155–59) discusses devices

novelists use to achieve it. See also Davis 1983:174-92.

¹⁰Lê Trị Viên and Hoàng Ngọc Phách discuss the Chinese and Vietnamese versions of Nhi Đô Mai in their introduction to a 1972 edition of the poem (pp. 11-25). This is the same Hoàng Ngọc Phách who wrote Tổ Tâm. He never wrote another novel but continued to edit traditional Vietnamese works. He also assisted in the preparation of an edition of Luc Vân Tiên! See Trần Nghĩa (1969:125).

¹⁷If traditional Vietnamese writers wanted to tell their own story, they had to do it surreptitiously, as Nguyễn Đình Chiều did in Luc Vân Tiên. In his poem he achieves what in real life eluded him: he regains his eyesight and rids the land of foreign invaders. Luc Vân Tiên is in this sense a personal poem. Davis (1983:11-24) points out that quasi-allegorical works are framed (the fact-fiction distinction is blurred) and this framing, he says, is a feature of the novel. The poem is not primarily a self-expressive work, however, and in all other respects it

is clearly a romance.

sometimes nicely avoiding the troublesome pronoun $t\hat{o}i$ by referring to himself as $k\hat{y}$ gia (reporter). When Đạm Thủy tells his story to the ký gia, however, Đạm Thủy refers to himself as tôi. Much of the novel consists of letters written by Dam Thủy and Tổ Tâm and most of chapter 5 is Tổ Tâm's diary. Thus Tổ Tâm is part first-person account, part epistolary novel, part diary. These devices were dramatically new and were rarely used even by later writers associated with the Self-Strength Literary Group [Tự lực văn đòan]. Note that the source for the story of Tổ Tâm is a friend, not an old book. Note also that Hoàng Ngọc Phách mentions his source in his preface and not in the body of the novel. His preface also contains this comment: "Because this reporter is not yet old enough to know how to invent characters for a story, this reporter has simply copied it down [as he heard it from his friend]" (TT, xii). 18 By mentioning in his preface that he is simply reporting a friend's story, Hoàng Ngọc Phách conveys the idea that To Tâm is a true story. Romance writers, in contrast, suggest that their protagonists are real historical figures, but they admit their plots are fictitious. To use a term Davis prefers, To Tâm is quite elaborately "framed," as was Defoe's Robinson Crusoe and many of the early European novels (1983:11-24): they are presented in such a way that readers do not know for sure whether the story is fact or fiction. This ambiguous relation to fact is, according to Davis, a distinguishing feature of the novel. Tố Tâm was clearly labeled a tiểu thuyết, which suggests a work of fiction, but the preface, the reportorial stance of the narrator, and the fact that the characters were like those that Vietnamese in Hanoi encountered every day encouraged readers to accept it as true. These encouragements apparently succeeded. In a 1942 interview Hoàng Ngoc Phách told how on a boat ride his companions threatened to throw him overboard and not let him back in the boat until he revealed the true identity of To Tâm (Lê Thanh 1942:105).

Davis argues that early English novelists like Defoe did not clarify whether they were writing truth or fiction because in the mid-eighteenth century "news" and "novels" were not yet clearly differentiated. He sees the novel as emerging from an undifferentiated news/novels matrix—as the result of a gradual sharpening of the distinction between journalistic and fictional prose. In other words, he suggests (Davis 1983:42-70, 154-73) that Defoe's elaborate framing of Robinson Crusoe, which makes it impossible to determine whether it is a true or fictitious account, was unconscious and that Defoe blurred the distinction between fact and fiction because he was not yet clear in his own mind about the difference between journalistic and novelistic prose. Was Hoàng Ngọc Phách equally unclear about the difference? Probably he was clear about it, because he had read modern French novels whose authors and readers were aware that fiction and journalism were different genres. Vietnamese readers were probably not so clear about the distinction. In the Vietnamese tradition prose was used to write moral treatises, history, and truyền kỳ stories, which, as we have pointed out, were a kind of embellished or pseudo-history. Prose was also used in journalism, of course, which by 1925 was well developed in Vietnam. 19 Hoàng Ngọc Phách may have blurred fact and fiction to give To Tâm the allure of news and associate it with an increasingly accepted genre—the journalistic account. Or he may have been influenced by French and Chinese works like Dumas fils's La dame aux camélias (see n. 16), Bourget's Le disciple, and Hsu Chen-ya's Hsueh hung lei shih (Vietnamese, Tuyết

¹⁸Compare this line from the first chapter of *La dame aux camélias*: "Since I am not yet of an age to invent, I must make do with telling a tale" (Dumas [1846] 1986:1).

¹⁹The first journal in *quốc ngữ* appeared in 1865. By the end of 1925 over fifty journals had been established in Vietnam (although not all were still publishing in 1925). See Huỳnh Văn Tòng 1973.

Hồng Lệ Su^2 [Sorrowful tale of a snow swan]) whose authors employ similar framing devices.

We now take up Davis's remaining distinction:

6. Romances value the preservation of virtue and chastity; novels tend to focus on illegal doings and forbidden passions. (Davis 1983:40)

In considering this distinction we shall begin to focus more on the content than on the form of Luc Vân Tiên and Tố Tâm. Distinction 6 is related to the rule of bienseance, included in Davis's ninth distinction. Bienseance refers to decorum, to the requirement accepted by the writers or romances that those characters who perform exemplary deeds should be rewarded and those who commit bad acts should be punished. In Vietnam bienseance was, until the twentieth century, accepted as a given. "The purpose of literature is to carry doctrine" (Văn dĩ tải đạo) says a Sino-Vietnamese proverb. Luc Vân Tiên qualifies as a romance because it demonstrates—perhaps better than some other verse narratives—this principle of bienseance. Plot becomes the instrument used to realize the principle: in the end the virtuous hero and heroine are rewarded with marriage and Vân Tiên obtains the throne, while the evildoers are devoured by tigers and whales or some other deus ex machina.

To Tâm does not completely abandon the rule of bienseance, but it inches away from it, thereby crossing the threshold separating romance from novel. This more than any other departure from traditional narration explains why Tō Tâm shocked its readers.

The Five Bonds, Loyalty-Filial Piety, and Chastity-Righteousness

What doctrine did the verse romances carry? Primarily the Confucian doctrine summed up by the Sino-Vietnamese phrases luân-thường (or cương-thường) and trung-hiếu tiết-nghĩa. The first phrase refers to the five bonds (luân or cương) and the five principles (thường) of moral conduct. The five bonds are king-subject, parent-child, husband-wife, older sibling-younger sibling, and friend-friend. The five principles are benevolent love (nhân), righteousness (nghĩa), propriety (lễ), wisdom (trí), and faith-fulness (tín). The second phrase names the virtues one should observe in fulfilling the bonds. Trung, loyalty, refers primarily to the first bond: subjects should be loyal to their king. Hiếu, filial piety, refers to the second bond: children should demonstrate filial devotion to their parents. Tiết, usually translated as chastity or purity, refers to the obligations of the wife in fulfilling the bond of husband-wife. To fulfill tiết a woman must preserve her virginity before marriage and remain faithful and obedient to her husband afterward. When her husband dies, she must not take another husband but must transfer her obedience to her oldest son. "To venerate one husband—that is tiết," Trần Văn Giàu explains (1973:252).

Nghĩa, one of the five principles, is used in the phrase tiết-nghĩa to refer to the obligations of the husband. The code of conduct suggested by the word nghĩa did not preclude the taking of more than one wife but it did require a high level of moral conduct. Often nghĩa appears with nhân, another of the five principles, in the compound word nhân-nghĩa. The phrase suggests a man who obeyed the common Sino-Vietnamese four-syllable expression, "Respect righteousness, despise riches" [Trọng nghĩa khinh tài], a man who helped the needy, a man who performed righteous deeds not for hope of material reward but because it was right to do so.

Traditional thought in Vietnam was shaped by other doctrines besides Confucianism; there were Buddhist, Taoist, and non-Sinic Southeast Asian elements. But

the importance of luân-thường for Vietnamese is undeniable. Phan Đình Phùng, a leader of struggles against the French in the 1880s who came from the same village as Hoàng Ngọc Phách (Đông Thái village in Hà Tĩnh Province), makes this clear: "Our country is thousands of years old; our land is not large, our troops are not strong, our wealth is not great; the one foundation on which to build our country is luân-thường: kingsubject, father-son" (quoted by Trần Văn Giàu 1973:221). 20 All Vietnamese verse narratives of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries preached the Confucian virtues of trung-hiếu tiết-nghĩa, and none did so more forcefully than Lục Vân Tiên. Nguyễn Đình Chiều announces his Confucian moral at the beginning of his poem: "Men take loyalty-filial piety [trung hiểu] as your rule,/Women take chastity [tiết-hạnh] as the word to improve yourselves" (lines 5-6). In the tale the hero and heroine exhibit the Confucian virtues at every turn. Vân Tiên demonstrates trung by being a loyal subject of his king and by helping him fight those who threaten the kingdom. He demonstrates hiểu by not taking his examination and by returning home for his mother's funeral and weeping so excessively over her death that he goes blind. He demonstrates nhânnghĩa by always being ready to perform righteous acts, like his saving of Nguyệt Nga from the brigands.

Nguyệt Nga is a fitting match for the virtuous Vân Tiên. By traveling long distances to join her father, who has been transferred to a faraway post, she demonstrates hiểu. About to be sent to a distant land as a tribute wife, she worries not about herself but about who will take care of her aging father, another demonstration of hiểu. When she is about to be offered as a tribute wife, she must make an impossible choice between the Confucian virtues of tiết, or faithfulness to Vân Tiên, and trung, loyalty to her king. Her inability to decide between these two virtues drives her to suicide.

The "Forbidden Passion" in To Tâm

In many aspects Tổ Tâm is a moral tale in the tài-tu giai nhân (talent-meets-beauty) tradition. Dam Thủy is a talented student (albeit one who reads French philosophy and novels, not the Four Books and Five Classics) and To Tam is a young woman who, like Thúy Kiều and Nguyệt Nga and other heroines of the verse narratives, possesses both beauty and literary talent. Dam Thủy demonstrates hiểu by agreeing, despite his love for To Tâm, to marry the woman his parents have chosen for him. To Tâm, like a typical heroine of a verse narrative, must decide between filial piety and her love for Dam Thuy. Outwardly she acquiesces and marries to please her mother, thereby demonstrating hiếu, but inwardly she remains pure and continues to worship Đạm Thủy, thereby demonstrating tiết. Like Nguyệt Nga in Lục Vân Tiên, she opts for suicide, not a quick suicide by drowning but a slow suicide by giving up the desire to live. Tổ Tâm is not married or even officially betrothed to Đam Thủy (that is what causes all the problems), but in the Vietnamese tradition private pledges of devotion, not only a public betrothal, could put a woman under the strictures of the husband-wife bond. Nguyệt Nga in Lục Vân Tiên, for example, is not publicly betrothed to Vân Tiên until the end of the story. Vân Tiên is not even aware that she is suffering to remain chaste for him. It is Nguyêt Nga's private pledge that makes her act toward Vân Tiên as a virtuous wife was expected to act toward her husband (Công Huyền Tôn Nữ Nha Trang 1973:62-77). Like Nguyệt Nga, Tố Tâm operates on the basis of a private, not a public, pledge.

²⁰Phan Đình Phùng mentions only the first two bonds, the two that were considered to be the most important because they were the basis for political stability.

Tố Tâm, however, definitely carries a different doctrine from Luc Vân Tiên. For one thing, Tổ Tâm and Đạm Thủy act in nontraditional ways. In Vietnam marriages were arranged by parents, and the bride and groom usually did not know each other, or knew each other only slightly, before they were married. Before marriage young people were to follow the rule Nam nữ thọ thọ bất thân (Men and women should never touch each other). Therefore scenes like the one at Đồ-Sơn where Tổ Tâm and Đạm Thủy walk along the beach alone and the one in which Tổ Tâm grasps Đạm Thủy's hand to show her love would have struck readers as new and daring. In fact, they would have bordered on the scandalous, because Đạm Thủy's parents have already engaged him to another woman. Tổ Tâm knows about Đạm Thủy's engagement and admits at one point that her love is hopeless, but she still persists in loving him. In traditional Vietnam love was always associated with marriage. In immersing herself in a love that has no chance of ending in marriage, Tổ Tâm definitely exhibits nontraditional behavior (Công Huyền Tôn Nư Nha Trang 1982:5).

But these aspects of Tô Tâm are only small indications of much more powerful influences shaping Vietnamese culture between the two world wars. To Tâm did not become a cause célèbre because it was considered prurient. Physical attraction is not an important force in To Tâm. To Tâm and Dam Thủy are attracted to each other because they share an interest in literature, intellectual discussion, and natural scenery. Hoàng Ngoc Phách has Đam Thủy explain that between two people whose love is based on mutual appreciation of the finer things of life physical beauty is secondary and the relationship can never deteriorate into something crudely physical (TT, 57). What is new about the To Tâm-Đam Thủy relationship is the two lovers' contemplation of the idea that their love for each other might be the most important thing in their existence—more important than obedience to parents and the maintenance of family harmony. This is the "forbidden passion" that upset conservative readers. Marriages were arranged by parents who often chose partners that would promote the prestige and economic well-being of the family. Children were expected to obey. Traditional Confucian morality placed a person so tightly within a web of social relations that it was difficult to think of oneself as an autonomous person with individual likes and dislikes, free to make personal choices. To Tâm shocked readers because Hoàng Ngoc Phách allows his characters to dream about individual happiness based on romantic love in a society still dominated by a morality that placed the well-being of the group, especially the family, above that of the individual. To use terms favored by a modern critic from Hanoi, To Tâm appeared when "capitalist individualism" was on the rise but "feudal Confucianism" still held sway (Phan Cư Đê 1974, 1:23). It is this tension in To Tâm that makes it such a striking document of a society in transition.

Tố Tâm's Foreign Relations

The notion that romantic love was the supreme happiness comes from the West, as Hoàng Ngọc Phách's Đạm Thủy is aware. At one point he thinks of running off to some remote area with Tổ Tâm and building a life together. "I thought of taking her away," Đạm Thủy explains, "and didn't worry about leaving my native land because I had been influenced by Western love novels, but then I realized that my feeling for the family was stronger and could smash this new influence and prevent me from doing anything rash" (TT, 61). In the end, Western individualism is defeated and traditional Confucian morality upheld.

Leslie Fiedler (1966) traces the notion of romantic love to codes of courtly love in eleventh-century Provence and to the eighteenth-century romantic movement. From

these sources emerged the bourgeois sentimental love novel, a type of novel that favors women's names for titles: Richardson's Clarissa, Rousseau's Julie, Lamartine's Graziella, Dumas fils's Camille. Hoàng Ngọc Phách's heroine Tổ Tâm is related to these heroines just as certainly as she is related to Hanh Nguyên, Thúy Kiều, Nguyêt Nga, and other heroines of the Vietnamese versions of Eastern talent-meets-beauty stories. To Tâm's behavior can be understood in two ways: as a demonstration of Vietnamese faithfulness (tiết) and loyalty (trung) to a man to whom she has secretly betrothed herself; or as an intentional, romantic, Rousseauian surrender to passion. Hoàng Ngọc Phách apparently realized that his heroine's actions could be understood in both ways. Because he, as a student at the teachers' college, was soon to be in charge of the moral development of Vietnamese youth and because he himself believed in the traditional dai gia đình, or great family, 21 he included a preface in which he presented the novel as an object lesson on the dangers of the kind of romantic love encouraged by Western novels. He also stressed To Tâm's Confucian virtues. Here is a woman, he says, who endures suffering rather than harm the man she loves. This feeling, he continues, "when applied in the home makes one a pious daughter [con hiếu], when applied to the country makes one a loyal subject [tôi ngay], when applied in the husband-wife relationship makes one a good wife and a kind mother" (TT, xi). Unfortunately, he analyzed love in such exacting detail and described so effectively how love is revealed in glances and gestures that readers, especially young readers, worshiped him—as Phạm Thế Ngũ (1965, 3:366) says—as a "teacher of love," not a "teacher of morality." Another critic suggests that Hoàng Ngọc Phách's imagination and artistic qualities put him in touch, perhaps unconsciously, with realities related to the attractions of romantic love that the "educator/moralist in him" prevented him at first from fully recognizing. When he recognized that his novel extolled and defended as much as it condemned romantic love, he added a preface to correct the damage (Công Huyền Tôn Nữ Nha Trang 1982:19-20).

Tổ Tâm has another preface, written by a friend of the author's named Lê Hữu Phúc. It sheds some light on this lack of fit between authorial intention and reader reaction and helps us understand what Hoàng Ngọc Phách meant by a tiểu thuyết tâm lý (psychological novel). Knowing that Tổ Tâm's readers would expect all stories to carry a moral message, he contrasts two approaches to moral education: an outdated approach in which ethical principles are presented as ready-made commandments that may not be discussed and a modern approach in which ethical principles are based on careful observation and study of human psychology. Having established this distinction, he associates the old *tiểu thuyết* ²²—"the kind of *tiểu thuyết* that specifies clearly, unambiguously, and directly what is good and what is bad"—with the old pedagogical approach and the tiểu thuyết tâm lý with the new approach (TT, vi-vii). When you read a psychological novel, Lê Hữu Phúc explains, you cannot simply imitate the behavior of the hero and heroine because, unlike characters in the old stories, these characters may not be moral exemplars. They are closer to case studies, and readers must analyze them and derive their own conclusions about their behavior. In other words, To Tâm does not have an explicit moral message announced at the start in ringing phrases as a verse narrative like Luc Vân Tiên does, but it contains warnings

²¹In his interview with Lê Thanh, Hoàng Ngọc Phách says he believes the Vietnamese family is a sacred institution that instills in people a willingness to sacrifice and to place altruism above selfishness. "In Tổ Tâm I wanted to present the amazing influence of the family. The characters in the story understand what it means to make sacrifices for one's parents" (Lê Thanh 1942: 109–11).

²²By "tiểu thuyết" here Lê Hữu Phúc means verse romances like Lục Vân Tiên

about the dangers of relationships like the one between Tổ Tâm and Đạm Thủy. Of course, Tổ Tâm's readers did not heed the warnings—not, we would suggest, primarily because they were unaccustomed to working for their moral messages (although that may have contributed) but because Tổ Tâm sent conflicting messages. Hoàng Ngọc Phách later gave a speech in which he presented arguments on the relation of literature to moral education identical to those presented in this preface by his friend (Hoàng Ngọc Phách [1933] 1941). Clearly in Tổ Tâm Hoàng Ngọc Phách was trying out the new approaches to moral education that he was learning at the teachers' college at the same time that he was experimenting with a more objective method popularized by French novelists like Maupassant and Bourget. No doubt he hoped that his educational and literary experiments would complement each other.

In sketching the history of the sentimental love novel, Fiedler says that it was from Richardson that Goethe and Rousseau²³ "learned the basic lesson that the subject of the novel is the 'human heart,' which is to say, the psyche in all its complexities and dark self-deceits, but especially in the moment of love" (1966:107). These and other European writers passed this lesson on to Hoàng Ngoc Phách. Consider for a moment the similarities between Clarissa and To Tâm: both heroines have names suggesting purity, both are models of virtue, both are lured by attractive male lovers into relationships of which their families and society disapprove, and both commit suicide by willing themselves to death. These similarities no doubt exist for two reasons: because of similarities between the socioeconomic conditions of England and France in the eighteenth century and Vietnam between the world wars (rising petit bourgeois class, capitalist economic system) and because Hoàng Ngọc Phách read French sentimental poems and novels. No doubt the second reason was more important than the first. French writers were very popular with Hoàng Ngoc Phách and his circle: "We read Bourget and Barrès," he told Lê Thanh in a 1942 interview, "but we preferred the writers and poets of the eighteenth and nineteenth century: Rousseau and Chateaubriand and the writers we called the 'top four': Lamartine, Hugo, Musset, and Vigny" (Lê Thanh 1942:102). Hoàng Ngoc Phách's character Đam Thủy quotes Lamartine (TT, 54) and Alfred De Vigny (TT, 16) and mentions reading Paul Bourget and Maurice Barrès (TT, 14). There are noticeable similarities between To Tâm and Lamartine's Graziella and Dumas fils's La dame aux camélias. All three are stories of a passionate, hopeless, and forbidden love; in all three works love is sacrificed to fulfill family responsibilities; in all three the hero reads wrenching letters from his lover after she has died.

Hoàng Ngọc Phách was clearly influenced directly by European writers; he was also influenced indirectly by them via Chinese mandarin duck and butterfly fiction, ²⁴ a type of fiction partially inspired by translations of European novels, especially by Lin Shu's popular translation of Dumas fils's La dame aux camélias (Link 1981:54). Hoàng Ngọc Phách's Tố Tâm is in many ways a Vietnamese version of Hsueh hung lei shih (The sorrowful tale of a snow swan) by Hsu Chen-ya (Vietnamese, Từ Trầm Á), which appeared in the Vietnamese journal Nam Phong in 1923 and 1924 in a translation by Mai Khê. Hoàng Ngọc Phách wrote Tổ Tâm in 1922 (see n. 1), but no doubt Mai Khê's (or someone else's) version was available before this version appeared in Nam Phong. Since Hoàng Ngọc Phách knew Chinese, he could also have read Hsueh hung

²³Clarissa appeared on the continent in 1751 in a French translation by Abbé Prévost.

²⁴This term was first used to refer to a kind of fiction that appeared in China in the 1910s. Its creators were fond of using the conventional symbols of mandarin ducks and butterflies for lovers; hence the name. Writers of the May 4th Movement later used the term to refer to many types of popular fiction written in an older style (Link 1981:7–8).

lei shih in the original Chinese. In any event the novels are strikingly similar. Both are elaborately framed with prefaces designed to suggest that the ensuing story is true, both are tales of hopeless love, both contain letters and diary entries, and both end sadly with the heroine willing herself to death. Link outlines six stages of the "Romantic Route" through which the characters in a mandarin duck novel passed: "(1) Extraordinary Inborn Gifts, (2) Supersensitivity, (3) Falling in Love, (4) Cruel Fate, (5) Worry and Disease, and (6) Destruction" (1981:64–78). To Tâm and Dam Thủy follow this route, providing further evidence that Tổ Tâm is a Vietnamese adaption of a formula popularized by Chinese writers of mandarin duck fiction. So similar are many of the passages in Tổ Tâm and Mai Khê's translation of Hsueh hung lei shih that if a passage were lifted from its context it would be difficult to tell from which work it came.

In his 1942 interview with Lê Thanh, Hoàng Ngoc Phách never mentioned Hsueh hung lei shih. He described his intentions regarding To Tâm: "My goal was to write a novel [tiểu thuyết] completely different—in both form and content—from existing novels. In form, I followed the new French novels; the way of telling the story, the description of scenes—all this was according to French literature. In content, I brought in some new thinking; the psychology of characters was analyzed following the techniques of the well-known contemporary novelists" (Lê Thanh 1942: 103-4). The leading practitioner of the psychological novel in the late nineteenth and early twentieth century was Paul Bourget, a friend of Maupassant's and a member of Émile Zola's circle. He experimented with realism and naturalism but later found psychological approaches more to his liking. He shared with the realists and naturalists a fondness for observation and detailed description with little authorial comment, but instead of describing outward appearances he preferred to describe the internal psychological states of his characters. Bourget's most successful novel was Le disciple (1889), the story of a young man, a "disciple" of a leading determinist philosopher, who drives a young woman to suicide when he uses her to test the validity of his master's theories. It seems clear that Hoàng Ngoc Phách was familiar with this work. He listed Bourget as a favorite author in the interview mentioned above, and there are some scenes in To Tâm that resemble scenes in Le disciple. For example, Robert Greslon (the disciple) and Dam Thủy discover in similar ways that their love is reciprocated—by coming across some revealing writing and mementos during an unannounced visit to their loved one's room. One critic suggests that Dam Thủy, like Robert Greslon, "at least half consciously, seduces Tổ Tâm by playing on her thirst for romantic literature" (Huỳnh Sanh Thông 1984:111).

These similarities, however, are less important than a similarity of technique. A great deal of Le disciple involves Robert Greslon's careful self-analysis of his emotions as he falls in love with Charlotte. Like Greslon, Dam Thủy analyzes his feelings in great detail as he reports how his relationship with Tổ Tâm moved from brotherly affection to passionate love. Detailed description of anything—outer appearances or inner mental states—was rare in the Vietnamese literary tradition. Phạm Quỳnh, a leading intellectual, collaborator with the French, and editor of the journal Nam Phong, pointed this out in 1921 in the first critical study of the Vietnamese novel. Traditional Chinese and Vietnamese writers preferred, he says, the "to record history" (chép sư) or "straight road" (đường thẳng) approach to story telling, which leaves no room for digressions or descriptions of scenes or feelings (Phạm Quỳnh 1921:8). The fixed poetic form of the verse narratives encouraged only very concise description, usually achieved by using clichés and allusions to the Chinese classics. At least four years before Hoàng Ngọc Phách wrote Tổ Tâm some writers had tried their hand at realistic description—most notably Pham Duy Tổn—and Pham Quỳnh published and praised their efforts

in his journal,²⁵ but Hoàng Ngọc Phách was the first northern writer to construct a long work of prose fiction that included extended descriptions of natural scenes and feelings. No doubt this innovation contributed to the dramatic effect *Tổ Tâm* had on its readers.

Conclusion

After Tổ Tâm the chasm between romance and novel became even greater. Hoàng Ngọc Phách's Đạm Thủy and Tổ Tâm are tempted by individualism, but in the end they sacrifice their personal pleasures in order to maintain the harmony of the đại gia đình (great family). In the early 1930s Nhất Linh and other writers of the Tự lực văn đòan (Self-Strength Literary Group) organized a movement that had as two of its ten announced aims the promotion of individualism and the eradication of Confucian morality. Hoàng Ngọc Phách only hints in Tổ Tâm that there may be something wrong with arranged marriages; the Self-Strength writers wrote novels that explicitly attacked them and other aspects of traditional, primarily Confucian morality. Tổ Tâm can be seen as a bridge spanning the gulf between verse narratives like Lực Vân Tiên and the works of the Self-Strength writers.

Lennard Davis says the rupture between romance and novel should not be understood as a deliberate revolt against romance; he is against oversimplified notions of influence that portray literary history as a linear series of individual writers consciously imitating or rebelling against previous writers. All questions of influence, he says, should be referred back to the sociocultural context (Davis 1983:41). The Vietnamese case partially confirms Davis's view, but of course unlike English novelists like Defoe and Richardson, who groped toward a genre that did not yet exist, Hoàng Ngọc Phách and other early Vietnamese novelists attempted to do in Vietnamese what others had already done in other languages. There was some deliberate imitation. But To Tâm cannot be understood as a simple act of rebellion or imitation. It was, as we have attempted to show, a product of its age. Hoàng Ngọc Phách understood this. In reflecting later on the impact of Tô Tâm, he said: "It seems to have appeared when we were waiting for such a novel" (Lê Thanh 1942:106).

List of References

- BOOTH, WAYNE C. 1966. The Rhetoric of Fiction. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- CAO THỊ NHƯ-QUỲNH and JOHN C. SCHAFER. Forthcoming. "Hồ Biểu Chánh and the Early Development of the Vietnamese Novel." Vietnam Forum.
- Công Huyèn Tôn Nu Nha Trang. 1973. "The Traditional Roles of Women as Reflected in Oral and Written Vietnamese Literature." Ph.D. diss., University of California, Berkeley.

²⁵See, for example, Pham Quỳnh's (1918:355) introduction to Pham Duy Tổn's "Sống Chết Mặc Bây" (A matter of life and death), a story employing objective and careful description that is modeled on "La partie de billard" by Alphonse Daudet.

²⁶These aims were printed in the journal *Phong Hóa* (Manners and morals), Mar. 2, 1987. ²⁷He hints this, for example, by having a wise uncle of Tổ Tâm's argue persuasively (but futilely) with her mother against forcing children to marry someone they do not love (64–65).

- ——. 1982. "Literary Love: From Hoàng Ngọc Phách's Tổ-Tâm to Khái Hưng's Nửa Chừng Xuân." Paper presented at the Harvard Conference on Early Modern Literature, Cambridge, Mass., June 22–27, 1982.
- DAVIS, LENNARD J. 1983. Factual Fictions: The Origins of the English Novel. New York: Columbia University Press.
- DEFRANCIS, JOHN. 1977. Colonialism and Language Policy in Vietnam. The Hague: Mouton.
- DUMAS fils, ALEXANDRE. [1846] 1986. La dame aux camélias. Trans. David Coward. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- DUONG QUANG HAM. [1941] 1968. Việt-Nam Văn-Học Sử-Yếu [Historical survey of Vietnamese literature]. Saigon: Bộ Giáo Dục.
- DURAND, MAURICE. 1962. "A Review of Nos. 10-20 of Văn Su Địa [Literature, history, geography]." Bulletin de l'École Française d'Extreme-Orient 50, no. 2:535-55.
- FIEDLER, LESLIE. 1966. Love and Death in the American Novel. New York: Stein and Day.
- HENRY, ERIC. 1984. "On the Nature of the Kiều Story." Vietnam Forum 3 (Winter-Spring):61-98.
- HOÀNG NGỌC PHÁCH. 1920. "Văn Chương với Nữ Giới" [On the relation of literature to women]. Nam Phong 41 (Nov.):379–83.
- ———. [1925] 1963. *Tō-Tâm: Tâm-Lý Tiều-Thuyết* [Tō-Tâm: A psychological novel]. N.p.: Thanh-Xuân.
- ——. [1933] 1941. "Lối Văn Trung Hậu" [Literature of loyalty]. In *Thời thế với Văn Chương* [Literature in relation to the times]. Hanoi: Công Lực.
- HSIA, C. T. 1968. The Classic Chinese Novel. New York: Columbia University Press. Huỳnh Sanh Thông, ed. and trans. 1979. The Heritage of Vietnamese Poetry. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- ———, ed. and trans. 1983. The Tale of Kièu. New Haven: Yale University Press.
 ———. 1984. "Main Trends of Vietnamese Literature Between the Two World Wars."

 Vietnam Forum 3 (Winter-Spring):99–125.
- HUỳNH VĂN TÒNG. 1973. Lịch Sử Báo Chí Việt Nam từ Khởi Thủy đến Năm 1930 [History of journalism in Vietnam from its origin until 1930]. Saigon: Trí Đăng.
- Lê THANH. 1942. Cuộc Phỏng Vấn Các Nhà Văn [Interviews with writers]. Hanoi: Đời Mới.
- LÊ TRỊ VIÊN and HOÀNG NGỌC PHÁCH, eds. 1972. Nhị Độ Mai [Twice-blooming plum flower]. Hanoi: Văn Học.
- LINK, E. PERRY. 1981. Mandarin Ducks and Butterflies: Popular Fiction in Early Twentieth-Century Chinese Cities. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press.
- MARR, DAVID. 1971. Vietnamese Anticolonialism. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press.
- ——. 1981. Vietnamese Tradition on Trial, 1920–1945. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press.
- NGUYỄN ĐÌNH CHIỀU. [ca. 1860] 1973. Lực Vân Tiên Truyện: Tường Giải. [The story of Lực Vân Tiên: Annotated]. Ed. Ngọc Hồ and Nhất Tâm. Saigon: Sống Mới.
- NGUYĒN ĐÌNH HÒA. 1982. "Studies in Nôm Characters: The State of the Art: Part 1." Vietnam Culture Journal 1 (Dec. 1982):25–36.
- NGUYÊN NGỌC BÍCH. 1986. Personal interview, July 18.
- NGUYÊN VĂN DÀN. 1967. "Một Số Ý Kiến về quyển Lục Vân Tiên" [Some opinions on the book Lục Vân Tiên]. Tạp Chí Văn Học 2:55-62.

- PHẠM QUỲNH. 1918. "Một Lối Văn Mới" [A new way of writing (Introduction to a short story by Phạm Duy Tốn called "Sống Chết Mặc Bây"—A matter of life and death)]. Nam Phong 18 (Dec.):355.
- ——. 1919. "Truyện Kiều" [The story of Kiều]. Nam Phong 30 (Dec.):480–500.
 ——. 1921. "Bàn về Tiểu Thuyết" [A discussion of the novel]. Nam Phong 48 (Jan.):1–15.
- PHẠM THẾ NGŨ. 1965. Việt Nam Văn Học Sử Giản Ước Tân Biên [Concise modern history of Vietnamese literature]. 3 vols. Saigon: Quốc Học Tùng Thư.
- PHAN Cự Đệ. 1974 and 1975. *Tiểu Thuyết Việt Nam Hiện Đại* [The contemporary Vietnamese novel]. 2 vols. Hanoi: Đại Học và Trung Học Chuyên Nghiệp.
- PHAN KHÔI. 1930. "Phép Làm Văn: Cách đặt Đại Danh Tử" [Rules for writing: The use of pronouns]. Phụ Nữ Tân Văn 73 (Oct. 9):13-14.
- SCHAFER, JOHN C. 1983. "Luc Vân Tiên: Its Relation to Prior Texts." Vietnam Forum 1 (Winter-Spring):58-66.
- TAYLOR, K. W. 1986. "Notes on the Việt điện u linh tập." Vietnam Forum 8 (Summer-Fall):26-59.
- THANH LÄNG. 1967. Bảng Lược Đồ Văn Học Việt Nam [Survey of Vietnamese literature]. 3 vols. Saigon: Trình Bày.
- TRÀN NGHĨA. 1969. "Thư Bàn về Nguồn Gốc Truyện Lục Vân Tiên" [A discussion of the source of Lục Vân Tiên]. In Mấy Vấn Đề về Cuộc Đời và Thơ Văn Nguyễn Đình Chiếu [Some aspects of the life and writing of Nguyễn Đình Chiếu]. Hanoi: Khoa Hoc Xã Hôi.
- TRÀN VĂN GIÀU. 1969. "Vì sao Tôi Thích Đọc Nguyễn Đình Chiều" [Why I like to read Nguyễn Đình Chiều]. In *Mây Vân Đề về Cuộc Đời và Thơ Văn Nguyễn Đình Chiều* [Some aspects of the life and writing of Nguyễn Đình Chiều]. Hanoi: Khoa Hoc Xã Hôi.
- ———. 1973 and 1975. Sự Phát Triển của Tư Tưởng ở Việt-Nam từ Thế Kỷ XIX đến Cách Mạng Tháng Tám [The development of ideas in Vietnam from the nineteenth century to the August revolution]. 3 vols. Hanoi: Khoa Học Xã Hội.
- VÕ LANG. 1964. "Tìm Hiểu Đồ-Chiếu qua Luc Vân Tiên" [An attempt to understand Teacher Chiếu through Luc Vân Tiên]. Văn Hóa Nguyêt San 13:1507–32.
- WATT, IAN. 1957. The Rise of the Novel. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press.